

**Tutorial Worksheet***Topic: Orthogonality, the Gram-Schmidt Process, and Least Squares Solutions*

**P1.** Determine whether the following statements are true or false and justify your answers.

- (a) Any orthogonal set of vectors is linearly independent.
- (b) Any linearly independent set of vectors is orthogonal.
- (c) Every nontrivial subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^n$  has an orthonormal basis.
- (d) For a vector  $\mathbf{x}$  in  $\mathbb{R}^n$  and a subspace  $W$  of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ , the orthogonal projection of  $\mathbf{x}$  onto  $W$ ,  $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{x}$  is orthogonal to every vector in  $W$ .
- (e) If  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$  is a consistent linear system, then  $A^T A\mathbf{x} = A^T \mathbf{b}$  is also consistent.
- (f) If  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$  is an inconsistent linear system, then  $A^T A\mathbf{x} = A^T \mathbf{b}$  is also inconsistent.

**Solution:**

- (a) **False.** An orthogonal set can contain the zero vector (since the zero vector is orthogonal to every vector). Any set containing the zero vector is linearly dependent. (However, any orthogonal set of *non-zero* vectors is linearly independent).
- (b) **False.** For example, the vectors  $\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$  are linearly independent but they are not orthogonal.
- (c) **True.** Every nontrivial subspace has a basis and so we can apply the Gram-Schmidt process to that basis and obtain an orthogonal basis. We can then normalize those vectors to produce an orthonormal basis.
- (d) **False.** The vector  $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{x}$  is *in* the subspace  $W$  and not orthogonal with itself unless it is the zero vector.
- (e) **True.** If  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$  is consistent, there is some  $\mathbf{x}$  that satisfies the equation. Multiplying both sides by  $A^T$  gives  $A^T A\mathbf{x} = A^T \mathbf{b}$ , meaning the exact same  $\mathbf{x}$  is a solution to the normal equations.
- (f) **False.** The normal equations  $A^T A\mathbf{x} = A^T \mathbf{b}$  are *always* consistent, regardless of whether  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$  is consistent or not. They yield the least squares solution(s).

**P2.** Let  $\mathbf{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$ , and let  $W$  be the subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$  spanned by  $\mathbf{u}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\mathbf{u}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$ .

(a) Find the orthogonal projection of  $\mathbf{v}$  onto  $W$ .

(b) Find the distance from  $\mathbf{v}$  to  $W$ .

(c) Find the distance from  $\mathbf{x} = \begin{bmatrix} -3 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$  to  $W$ .

*Hint:* How does  $\mathbf{x}$  relate to  $\mathbf{u}_1$  and  $\mathbf{u}_2$ ?

**Solution:**

(a) **Solution #1:** Since  $\mathbf{u}_1$  and  $\mathbf{u}_2$  are orthogonal, we use the projection formula:

$$\text{proj}_W \mathbf{v} = \frac{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_1}{\mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1} \mathbf{u}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_2}{\mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2} \mathbf{u}_2$$

Calculating the necessary dot products:

$$\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_1 = (0)(1) + (-1)(0) + (2)(1) = 2$$

$$\mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1 = 1^2 + 0^2 + 1^2 = 2$$

$$\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 = (0)(-2) + (-1)(1) + (2)(2) = 3$$

$$\mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 = (-2)^2 + 1^2 + 2^2 = 9$$

Substituting these into the formula:

$$\text{proj}_W \mathbf{v} = \frac{2}{2} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{3}{9} \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} -2/3 \\ 1/3 \\ 2/3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/3 \\ 1/3 \\ 5/3 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Solution #2:** Alternatively, we can use the projection matrix  $P = A(A^T A)^{-1} A^T$  where  $A$  is the matrix whose columns are the basis vectors of  $W$ :

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -2 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Here is a step-by-step calculation of  $P$ :

$$A^T A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 \\ -2 & 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -2 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 9 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$(A^T A)^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/2 & 0 \\ 0 & 1/9 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$(A^T A)^{-1} A^T = \begin{bmatrix} 1/2 & 0 \\ 0 & 1/9 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 \\ -2 & 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/2 & 0 & 1/2 \\ -2/9 & 1/9 & 2/9 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$P = A(A^T A)^{-1} A^T = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -2 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1/2 & 0 & 1/2 \\ -2/9 & 1/9 & 2/9 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{18} \begin{bmatrix} 17 & -4 & 1 \\ -4 & 2 & 4 \\ 1 & 4 & 17 \end{bmatrix}$$

We compute the projection by multiplying the projection matrix  $P$  by  $\mathbf{v}$ :

$$\text{proj}_W \mathbf{v} = P\mathbf{v} = \frac{1}{18} \begin{bmatrix} 17 & -4 & 1 \\ -4 & 2 & 4 \\ 1 & 4 & 17 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{18} \begin{bmatrix} 6 \\ 6 \\ 30 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/3 \\ 1/3 \\ 5/3 \end{bmatrix}$$

(b) The distance from  $\mathbf{v}$  to  $W$  is the magnitude of the orthogonal component (the error vector),  $\|\mathbf{v} - \text{proj}_W \mathbf{v}\|$ .

$$\mathbf{v} - \text{proj}_W \mathbf{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 1/3 \\ 1/3 \\ 5/3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -1/3 \\ -4/3 \\ 1/3 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{Distance} = \|\mathbf{v} - \text{proj}_W \mathbf{v}\| = \sqrt{(-1/3)^2 + (-4/3)^2 + (1/3)^2} = \sqrt{\frac{1}{9} + \frac{16}{9} + \frac{1}{9}} = \sqrt{\frac{18}{9}} = \sqrt{2}$$

(c) Since  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{u}_2 - \mathbf{u}_1$ , the vector  $\mathbf{x}$  is already in  $W$ , and so the distance from  $\mathbf{x}$  to  $W$  is zero.

**P3.** Let  $W$  be the subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^2$  spanned by  $\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$ .

(a) Find the standard matrix,  $P$ , of the orthogonal projection onto  $W$ .

(b) Use  $P$  to find the orthogonal projection of  $\mathbf{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix}$  onto  $W$ .

**Solution:**

(a) For a matrix  $A$  **with independent columns**, the projection matrix in general is  $P = A(A^T A)^{-1} A^T$ . For a 1-dimensional subspace spanned by  $\mathbf{v}$ , then the matrix  $A$  consists of a single column  $\mathbf{v}$ . Hence,  $A^T A = \mathbf{v}^T \mathbf{v}$  is the dot product  $\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v}$ , which is just a number. Thus,  $P = \frac{\mathbf{v} \mathbf{v}^T}{\mathbf{v}^T \mathbf{v}}$ .

$$P = \frac{1}{1^2 + 2^2} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{5} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 \\ 2 & 4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/5 & 2/5 \\ 2/5 & 4/5 \end{bmatrix}.$$

(b)

$$\text{proj}_W \mathbf{v} = P \mathbf{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/5 & 2/5 \\ 2/5 & 4/5 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/5 - 2/5 \\ 2/5 - 4/5 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -1/5 \\ -2/5 \end{bmatrix}$$

**P4.** Use the Gram-Schmidt process to find an orthogonal basis for the column space of the matrix  $\begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 0 \\ -1 & 2 & 2 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$ .

Then, normalize the orthogonal basis.

**Solution:**

Let the columns be  $x_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ ,  $x_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ , and  $x_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ . We apply the Gram-Schmidt process to find orthogonal vectors  $v_1, v_2, v_3$ :

**Step 1:**  $v_1 = x_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$

**Step 2:**  $v_2 = x_2 - \frac{x_2 \cdot v_1}{v_1 \cdot v_1} v_1$

$$x_2 \cdot v_1 = (1)(0) + (2)(-1) + (0)(1) = -2 \quad \text{and} \quad v_1 \cdot v_1 = 2$$

$$v_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} - \frac{-2}{2} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Step 3:**  $v_3 = x_3 - \frac{x_3 \cdot v_1}{v_1 \cdot v_1} v_1 - \frac{x_3 \cdot v_2}{v_2 \cdot v_2} v_2$

$$x_3 \cdot v_1 = (0)(0) + (2)(-1) + (1)(1) = -1 \quad \text{and} \quad x_3 \cdot v_2 = (0)(1) + (2)(1) + (1)(1) = 3$$

$$v_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} - \frac{-1}{2} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} - \frac{3}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1/2 \\ 1/2 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1/2 \\ 1/2 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Normalization:** We divide each orthogonal vector by its magnitude to get the orthonormal basis  $\{w_1, w_2, w_3\}$ :

$$\|v_1\| = \sqrt{2} \implies w_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1/\sqrt{2} \\ 1/\sqrt{2} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\|v_2\| = \sqrt{3} \implies w_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1/\sqrt{3} \\ 1/\sqrt{3} \\ 1/\sqrt{3} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\|v_3\| = \sqrt{1 + 1/4 + 1/4} = \sqrt{3/2} = \frac{\sqrt{6}}{2} \implies w_3 = \frac{2}{\sqrt{6}} \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1/2 \\ 1/2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -2/\sqrt{6} \\ 1/\sqrt{6} \\ 1/\sqrt{6} \end{bmatrix}$$

**P5.** Find a least squares solution of  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$  for  $A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 2 & 0 \\ 3 & -1 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}$ .

*Hints:*

- 1) Notice that the system is inconsistent.
- 2) Let  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}$  be a least squares solution of  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ . Recall that  $\mathbf{b} - A\hat{\mathbf{x}} = \text{perp}_{\text{Col}(A)} \mathbf{b}$ . The least squares solution  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}$  satisfies  $A^T(\mathbf{b} - A\hat{\mathbf{x}}) = 0$ , also expressed as  $A^T\mathbf{b} = A^TA\hat{\mathbf{x}}$ .

**Solution:**

The least squares solution  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}$  satisfies the normal equations  $A^TA\hat{\mathbf{x}} = A^T\mathbf{b}$ . First, compute  $A^TA$ :

$$A^TA = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 3 \\ 1 & 0 & -1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 2 & 0 \\ 3 & -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} (1+4+9) & (1+0-3) \\ (1+0-3) & (1+0+1) \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 14 & -2 \\ -2 & 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Next, compute  $A^T\mathbf{b}$ :

$$A^T\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 3 \\ 1 & 0 & -1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2+2-6 \\ 2+0+2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}$$

Now, solve the system  $\begin{bmatrix} 14 & -2 \\ -2 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}$ :

$$\begin{aligned} 14x_1 - 2x_2 &= -2 \\ -2x_1 + 2x_2 &= 4 \end{aligned}$$

Adding the two equations together yields  $12x_1 = 2$ , which means  $x_1 = 1/6$ .

Substitute  $x_1$  back into the second equation:

$$-2(1/6) + 2x_2 = 4 \implies -1/3 + 2x_2 = 4 \implies 2x_2 = 13/3 \implies x_2 = 13/6$$

The least squares solution is  $\hat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/6 \\ 13/6 \end{bmatrix}$ .